



# 5. CONCLUSIONS **RECOMMENDATIONS**

This report highlights the expansive and complicated nature of wildlife trade. While the challenges to overcome these problems remain, some of which are complicated, there exists some notable efforts, enabling environment and platforms at local, national, regional and international levels. These present an opportunity for all actors—either those involved in or have a stake in the trade—to address this problem. Concerted effort at all levels, political will and a deployment of adequate resources are necessary to combat the illegal wildlife trade in Southeast Asia.

A range of key priority interventions and recommendations are made below to support ASEAN governments, partners and stakeholders in their decision-making processes and strategic action. These are drawn and refined from the breadth of existing literature reviewed for this assessment. While more country-specific recommendations are included in the country profiles in Chapter 4 of this report, broader interventions below, applicable region-wide, are grouped in Table 7 under five main thematic areas as follows:

- **Policy** – interventions where local and international legal frameworks can be strengthened to stop and deter wildlife traffickers;
- **Law enforcement** – interventions where enforcement authorities and prosecutors at the frontline can optimise their output for the disruption of wildlife trafficking;
- **Demand reduction** – interventions aiming to influence the purchasing preferences and buyer behaviour of potential and actual consumer groups;
- **Cross-sector co-operation** – interventions where external parties such as the private sector, civil society organisations, and conservation practitioners can assist and facilitate effective actions;
- **Research gaps** – interventions to address knowledge gaps to improve anti-wildlife trafficking decisions and policy.

Table 7: Summary of Interventions to tackle wildlife trafficking involving Southeast Asia (BN: Brunei; KH: Cambodia; ID: Indonesia; LA: Lao PDR; MM: Myanmar, MY: Malaysia, PH: Philippines, SG: Singapore; TH: Thailand; VN: Viet Nam)

Area of intervention	Required interventions	Target audience	Priority country
Close loopholes and harmonise national legislation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Revise legislation in Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Malaysia (Sabah and Sarawak), Myanmar, Philippines, Thailand, and Viet Nam to include all CITES-listed species in national protection lists;</li> <li>• Increase penalties to a harmonised level of deterrent across the different national laws in which wildlife offences are dealt with across ASEAN, including provisions that empowering enforcement officers to pursue necessary investigations;</li> <li>• Criminalise online advertisements and offers for sale of protected wildlife species or products, through specific provisions in the law;</li> <li>• Where a particular rare or threatened or endemic species with a restricted range is heavily impacted by international trade, consider the inclusion of that species in CITES Appendix III;</li> <li>• Ensure appropriate resources and budget allocation to support law enforcement actions, along with facilities for rescued wildlife and repatriation, which also helps ensure these specimens do not leak back into the illegal trade chain.</li> </ul>	ASEAN Governments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BN, KH, ID, LA, MY (Sabah and Sarawak), PH, TH, VN</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• BN, KH, LA, MM, SG, VN</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> </ul>

<p>From seizures to successful convictions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Identify and shut down open markets<sup>96</sup> selling protected wildlife and their products;</li> <li>• Prevent the establishment of any further captive tiger and bear facilities (including farms), and ensure that current stock is not augmented to allow sale/leakage into the illegal trade; current facilities found to be conducting business illegally should be shut down;</li> <li>• More robust regulation and controls to assess the management of other farms and breeding facilities for commercial trade, such as those for reptiles and birds;</li> <li>• Severely constrict illegal online availability of wildlife on commercial trade platforms and trade via social media, working with online businesses—including through the Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online, and transport/logistics companies;</li> <li>• Utilise existing national anti-money laundering and anti-corruption frameworks to process wildlife trafficking cases as predicate offences by initiating financial investigations, application of harsher penalties and recovery of proceeds. This includes preventing, identifying and addressing corruption-related cases;</li> <li>• Conduct proactive intelligence-led and in-depth investigations, including the use of social network analysis, controlled deliveries, and financial investigations along the trade chains;</li> <li>• Improve detection of illegal shipments with systematic and regular monitoring, and enhanced equipment (e.g. use of sniffer dogs and scanner machines) and techniques (e.g. risk profiling) to identify geographical or logistical nodes as monitoring targets;</li> <li>• Enhance reporting and communications mechanisms by customs and other relevant agencies in countries of import, transit and (re-)export regarding suspicious practices both at national level as well as at port of entry and exit, including illegal trade reporting as mandated by CITES;</li> </ul>	<p>CITES Management Authorities, Customs, Police, Prosecutors and the judiciary; ASEAN bodies such SOMTC; NGOs</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ID, LA, MM, PH, TH, VN</li> <li>• VN, TH, LA, MM</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> </ul>
--	---	--	---

<sup>96</sup> Here, open markets are taken to refer to establishments that sell wildlife parts and products that are prohibited from trade, either by national legislation or non-native species listed in CITES Appendix I and prohibited from commercial trade such as rhino horns, tigers, pangolins, reptiles and others. These open markets are slightly different from local-level stalls or markets selling wild meat, predominantly for local consumption where in many cases legislation permits trade, but falls short in its licensing and permitting enforcement.



<p>From seizures to successful convictions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Establish a standardised system to track law enforcement incidences, such as the Law Enforcement Management Information System (LEMIS) database utilised in the USA or the EU-TWIX (Trade in Wildlife Information Exchange) platform in Europe, for the purposes of enhancing law enforcement efforts;</li> <li>• Work with civil society organisations to harness public participation initiatives to support law enforcement actions, such as through hotlines or reporting apps;</li> <li>• Promote inter-agency co-operation on intelligence and data sharing across national law enforcement agencies and between countries;</li> <li>• Support where available the use and advancement of wildlife DNA forensic techniques to identify provenance, and authenticity of wildlife parts and products traded to strengthen enforcement actions and prosecutions; where this is done, results must be shared with all the relevant countries to strengthen national-level efforts;</li> <li>• Capacity building and training with enforcement and judiciary bodies, including joint training sessions, bringing together prosecutors and judges.</li> </ul>	<p>CITES Management Authorities, Customs, Police, Prosecutors and the judiciary. ASEAN bodies such SOMTC, NGOs</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> </ul>
<p>Monitoring and Reporting</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Continue monitoring at known and emerging physical and online markets to catalyse evidence-based action by law enforcement interventions, identification of emerging threats and keeping watch on trends over time, including shifts in consumer market availability as a response to stricter law enforcement;</li> <li>• Improve regulations, transparency and accountability of the many captive breeding facilities in the region to ensure that laundering of wild-caught species does not occur and that trade is not detrimental to wild populations; stricter scrutiny and periodic science-based assessments by CITES on country operations for trade in CITES-listed is imperative;</li> <li>• Establish a transparent reporting and monitoring system on captive breeding operations, including making information publicly accessible by species, quotas and trading partners.</li> </ul>	<p>CITES Management Authorities, Customs, NGOs, business and industries</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> </ul>

<p>Use of a twin-track approach</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ensure that efforts to constrict supply and remove illegal wildlife products from the market are complemented by campaigns targeting priority high-risk groups of consumers with messaging that addresses their underlying motivations to consume illegal wildlife commodities, achieves changes in their behaviour, thereby reducing demand;</li> <li>• Develop strategic Social and Behavioural Change Communications (SBCC) approaches to influence effectively the behaviour of key target audience segments related to their purchase and use of illegal wildlife commodities.. The SBCC approaches should be informed by evidence and insight into consumers' attitudes, values and motivations;</li> <li>• Align government-led actions to change behaviour with implementation of CITES Resolution (Res.Conf 17.4) on Demand Reduction, and relay success factors and lessons learned back to <a href="http://www.changewildlifeconsumers.org">www.changewildlifeconsumers.org</a> in line with guidance;</li> <li>• Work with priority industry sectors including e-commerce and social media, travel and tourism and transport and logistics, medical practitioners and the traditional medicine community to influence supply chains, market availability and consumer preference;</li> <li>• Foster increased leadership on these issues amongst champions for each target audience and enable them to influence the intentions of their peers and followers.</li> </ul>	<p>Private sector, individuals / public figures, NGOs, academia</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ID, KH, LA, MM, MY, SG, TH, VN</li> <li>• Bear bile (MY, TH, VN, MM), tigers (VN, LA, MM, TH), rhino horn (VN), live reptiles and birds (ID, MY, SG, TH, VN), ivory (KH, LA, MM, TH, VN)</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• All</li> </ul>
-------------------------------------	---	---	---

	<p>Continue engagement with the private sector (e.g. tourism, transport and logistics, e-commerce, banks) to be the eyes and the ears of enforcement agencies by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Facilitating the tracking of bank accounts and transactions of businesses and individuals linked to wildlife crime to enable deeper investigations into trade chains and potential money laundering operations; shutting down operations / accounts where there is clear evidence of illegality;</li> <li>• Establishing and/or improving corporate policies and standard operating procedures around zero tolerance for wildlife trafficking;</li> <li>• Promote do's and don'ts and red flags to business partners to prevent and/or detect illegal activities.</li> </ul> <p>Continue engagement with NGOs, civil society, academia to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Continue monitoring of physical and online markets (linked to law enforcement above);</li> <li>• Assist with species or wildlife product identification and information, and intelligence sharing, including support with investigations as required.</li> </ul> <p>Expand inter-governmental collaboration particularly at national levels:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Establish joint engagement platforms involving a range of sectors, such as those responsible for national security, customs and immigration, multimedia and communications and others, to develop mitigation measures along all points of the illegal trade, such as the LEMIS or TWIX approaches in the US, Europe and Africa.</li> </ul>	<p>Private sector, NGOs, civil society, academia, experts</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All</li> </ul>
--	---	---	---

	<p>Undertake periodical research tasks—including through collaboration with NGOs, research institutions and other relevant partners—to establish contemporary knowledge and understanding of trade threats and dynamics that require interventions, such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review and update ASEAN countries' rate of prosecutions and convictions against arrests and seizures, including judicial capacity, to identify and address needs to ensure stiffer sentencing and penalties are meted out;</li> <li>• Analyse information on market availability, CITES trade data as reported by governments and seizures to assist in the identification of emerging trends or common problems facilitating illegal wildlife trade to inform policy and regulatory needs;</li> <li>• Conduct consumer research to understand the motivations of consumers of specific species, and gain insight into the most effective ways to influence their choice and reduce their demand for illegal wildlife commodities using SBCC initiatives</li> <li>• Ensure a comprehensive approach to impact measurement is undertaken – for example, by contextualising fluctuations in consumer expressed intent to purchase illegal wildlife products in the future, against market monitoring data of wholesale price, volume of offers for sale and throughput of product in the market. Also consider e.g. retailer perception surveys and other social science methods, share learning and insights with the Community of Practice working on demand reduction (<a href="http://www.changewildlifeconsumers.org">www.changewildlifeconsumers.org</a>).</li> </ul>	<p>NGOs, academia, civil society, judiciary</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ID, KH, LA, MM, PH, TH, VN</li> <li>• All</li> <li>• ID (birds, reptiles), KH (ivory, wild meat), LA (wild meat), MM (wild meat, TM), MY (live birds, reptiles, traditional medicine), SG (TM, live birds), TH (ivory, live birds, live reptiles, wild meat, TM), VN (rhino horn, live reptiles, ivory, wild meat, TM)</li> </ul>
--	---	---	--